

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF MICHIGAN
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

In Re: AUTOMOTIVE PARTS
ANTITRUST LITIGATION

Master File No. 12-md-02311
Honorable Marianne O. Battani

In Re: ALL AUTO PARTS CASES

2:12-md-02311-MOB-MKM

THIS RELATES TO:

All Dealership Actions

**DEFENDANTS' OPPOSITION TO AUTO DEALER PLAINTIFF
HOLZHAUER AUTO AND TRUCK SALES, INC.'S MOTION
TO STAY CONSIDERATION OF HOLZHAUER'S OBJECTION
TO MASTER ESSHAKI'S AUGUST 3, 2015 AMENDED RULING**

CONCISE STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES PRESENTED

1. Whether the Court should stay consideration of Auto Dealer Plaintiff Holzhauer Auto and Truck Sales, Inc.'s ("Holzhauer") Objection to, and Motion to Modify, Special Master Esshaki's August 3, 2015 Amended Ruling now that the Special Master has ruled on Holzhauer's Motion To Withdraw?

Answer: No.

STATEMENT OF CONTROLLING OR MOST APPROPRIATE AUTHORITIES

Rulings

Order Granting Automobile Dealer Plaintiff Holzhauer Auto and Truck Sales, Inc.'s Rule 21 Motion To Be Dropped as a Named Plaintiff and Proposed Class Representative (12-md-02311, ECF No. 1113) (September 29, 2015).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
CONCISE STATEMENT OF THE ISSUES PRESENTED.....	i
STATEMENT OF CONTROLLING OR MOST APPROPRIATE AUTHORITIES.....	ii
ARGUMENT.....	1

ARGUMENT

Since last March, Plaintiff Holzhauer Auto and Truck Sales, Inc. (“Holzhauer”) has simply refused to comply with its discovery obligations, including by filing (in late August 2015) a motion seeking permission to withdraw from this litigation without meeting any of those obligations. The Special Master has now *twice* ordered Holzhauer to comply with its longstanding discovery obligations, regardless of whether it is permitted to withdraw, and yet Holzhauer still has not obeyed these orders. The first of these Orders was issued on August 3, the second on September 29. Holzhauer’s objection to the first of these Orders has been fully briefed and is ready for decision. Auto Dealers’ motion that the Court stay its disposition of that objection has been rendered moot by the Special Master’s September 29 Order and therefore should be denied.

In his August 3, 2015 Amended Ruling, the Special Master granted Defendant’s Motion to Compel, ruling that Holzhauer must comply with its long-standing discovery obligations under the Special Master’s Stipulated Orders of January 7, 2015 and May 12, 2015, even if Holzhauer were to move to withdraw as a class representative. On August 24, 2015, Holzhauer filed its objection to the Amended Ruling, arguing that the Special Master had abused his discretion in requiring Holzhauer to comply with its discovery obligations as a condition of withdrawal. The next day, Holzhauer filed a motion to withdraw under Fed. R. Civ. P. 21, arguing (directly contrary to the August 3 Amended Ruling) that doing so entitled Holzhauer to avoid its discovery obligations.

On September 21, 2015, Auto Dealers asked this Court to stay its ruling on Holzhauer’s objection to the Amended Ruling “until Special Master Esshaki rules on Holzhauer’s pending Rule 21 motion to withdraw.” (12-md-02311, ECF No. 1105 at 1.) On September 29, 2015, the Special Master ruled on Holzhauer’s Rule 21 Motion, specifically reaffirming his August 3 Order “requiring Holzhauer to comply with the January 7 and May 12, 2015 Stipulated Discovery Orders

prior to [its] withdrawal becoming effective.” Order Granting Automobile Dealer Plaintiff Holzhauser Auto and Truck Sales, Inc.’s Rule 21 Motion To Be Dropped as a Named Plaintiff and Proposed Class Representative (12-md-02311, ECF No. 1113).

There is therefore no reason to further delay a ruling on Holzhauser’s Objection to, and Motion to Modify, the Special Master’s August 3, 2015 Amended Ruling. The Special Master now has ruled *twice* that Holzhauser must comply with the Special Master’s prior orders of January 7 and May 12, 2015, *both* of which Holzhauser had *stipulated* to in order to avoid pending motions to compel. To finally put an end to Holzhauser’s protracted delay in meeting its basic discovery obligations, Defendants respectfully request that the Court both (1) deny Holzhauser’s Motion To Stay as moot, and (2) deny Holzhauser’s fully-briefed objection to the Special Master’s August 3, 2015 Amended Ruling.

Respectfully submitted,

WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND
DORR LLP

October 6, 2015

By: /s/ Steven F. Cherry
Steven F. Cherry
David P. Donovan
Patrick J. Carome
Dyanne M. Griffith
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE AND
DORR LLP
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, D.C. 20006
Tel.: (202) 663-6000
Fax: (202) 663-6363
steven.cherry@wilmerhale.com
david.donovan@wilmerhale.com
patrick.carome@wilmerhale.com
dyanne.griffith@wilmerhale.com

*Attorneys for Defendants DENSO Corporation
and DENSO International America, Inc.*

Steven M. Zarowny (P33362)

General Counsel
DENSO International America, Inc.
24777 Denso Drive
Southfield, MI 48033
Tel.: (248) 372-8252
Fax: (248) 213-2551
steve_zarowny@denso-diam.com

*Attorney for Defendant DENSO International
America, Inc.*

K&L GATES LLP

October 6, 2015

By: /s/ William R. Jansen (w/consent)
William R. Jansen (P36688)
Michael G. Brady (P57331)
Amanda M. Fielder (P70180)
WARNER NORCROSS & JUDD LLP
2000 Town Center, Suite 2700
Southfield, MI 48075-1318
Telephone: (248) 784-5000
wjansen@wnj.com
mbrady@wnj.com
afielder@wnj.com

Michael Martinez
Steven M. Kowal
Lauren N. Norris
Lauren B. Salins
K&L GATES LLP
70 W. Madison St., Suite 3100
Chicago, IL 60602
Telephone: (312) 807-4404
Fax: (312) 827-8116
michael.martinez@klgates.com
steven.kowal@klgates.com
lauren.norris@klgates.com
lauren.salins@klgates.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Chiyoda Manufacturing
Corporation and Chiyoda USA Corporation*

LANE POWELL PC

October 6, 2015

By: /s/ Larry S. Gangnes (w/consent)
Larry S. Gangnes
LANE POWELL PC
U.S. Bank Centre
1420 Fifth Ave., Suite 4200

P.O. Box 91302
Seattle, WA 98111-9402
Tel.: (206) 223-7000
Fax: (206) 223-7107
gangnesl@lanepowell.com

Craig D. Bachman
Kenneth R. Davis II
Darin M. Sands
Masayuki Yamaguchi
Peter D. Hawkes
LANE POWELL PC
MODA Tower
601 SW Second Ave., Suite 2100
Portland, OR 97204-3158
Tel.: (503) 778-2100
Fax: (503) 778-2200
bachmanc@lanepowell.com
davisk@lanepowell.com
sandsd@lanepowell.com
yamaguchim@lanepowell.com
hawkesp@lanepowell.com

Richard D. Bisio (P30246)
Ronald S. Nixon (P57117)
KEMP KLEIN LAW FIRM
201 W. Big Beaver, Suite 600
Troy, MI 48084
Tel.: (248) 528-1111
Fax: (248) 528-5129
richard.bisio@kkue.com
ron.nixon@kkue.com

*Attorneys for Defendants Furukawa Electric Co.,
Ltd. and American Furukawa, Inc.*

PORTER WRIGHT MORRIS & ARTHUR LLP

October 6, 2015

By: /s/ Donald M. Barnes (w/consent)
Donald M. Barnes
Molly S. Crabtree
Jay L. Levine
PORTER WRIGHT MORRIS & ARTHUR LLP
1900 K Street, NW, Ste. 1110
Washington, DC 20006
Tel.: (202) 778-3054
Fax: (202) 778-3063
dbarnes@porterwright.com
mcrabtree@porterwright.com
jlevine@porterwright.com

Attorneys for Defendants G.S. Electech, Inc.,

G.S.W. Manufacturing, Inc., and G.S. Wiring Systems, Inc.

O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP

October 6, 2015

By: /s/ Michael F. Tubach (w/consent)
Michael Tubach
O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP
Two Embarcadero Center, 28th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94111
Tel.: (415) 984-8700
Fax: (415) 984-8701
Mtubach@omm.com

Michael R. Turco (P48705)
BROOKS WILKINS SHARKEY & TURCO
PLLC
401 South Old Woodward, Suite 400
Birmingham, MI 48009
Tek.: (248) 971-1713
Fax: (248) 971-1801
turco@bwst-law.com

Attorneys for Defendants Leoni Wiring Systems, Inc. and Leonische Holding, Inc.

JENNER & BLOCK LLP

October 6, 2015

By: /s/ Terrence J. Truax (w/consent)
Terrence J. Truax
Charles B. Sklarsky
Michael T. Brody
Gabriel A. Fuentes
Daniel T. Fenske
JENNER & BLOCK LLP
353 N. Clark Street
Chicago, IL 60654-3456
ttruza@jenner.com
csklarsky@jenner.com
mbrody@jenner.com
gfuentes@jenner.com
defenske@jenner.com

Gary K. August
Jamie J. Janisch
ZAUSMER, AUGUST & CALDWELL, P.C.
31700 Middlebelt Road, Suite 150
Farmington Hills, MI 48334-2374
gaugust@zacfirm.com

jjasnisch@zacfirm.com

Counsel for Defendants Mitsubishi Electric Corporation, Mitsubishi Electric US Holdings, Inc., and Mitsubishi Electric Automotive America, Inc.

BUTZEL LONG

October 6, 2015

By: /s/ Sheldon H. Klein (w/consent)
Sheldon H. Klein (P41062)
David F. DuMouchel (P25658)
BUTZEL LONG
150 West Jefferson, Suite 100
Detroit, MI 48226
Tel.: (313) 225-7000
Fax: (313) 225-7080
sklein@butzel.com
dumouchd@butzel.com

W. Todd Miller
BAKER & MILLER PLLC
2401 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Suite 300
Washington, DC 20037
Tel.: (202) 663-7820
Fax: (202) 663-7849
TMiller@bakerandmiller.com

Attorneys for Defendants TRAM, Inc. and Tokai Rika Co., Ltd.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on October 6, 2015, I caused the foregoing **DEFENDANTS' OPPOSITION TO AUTO DEALER PLAINTIFF HOLZHAUER AUTO AND TRUCK SALES, INC.'S MOTION TO STAY CONSIDERATION OF HOLZHAUER'S OBJECTION TO MASTER ESSHAKI'S AUGUST 3, 2015 AMENDED RULING** to be electronically filed with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to all counsel of record.

/s/ Steven F. Cherry

Steven F. Cherry

WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE

AND DORR LLP

1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20006

Tel.: (202) 663-6000

Fax: (202) 663-6363

steven.cherry@wilmerhale.com

*Counsel for DENSO Corporation and DENSO
International America, Inc.*